Ruby - Bug #3406

attr_accessor creates a private writer method

06/08/2010 01:18 AM - vjoel (Joel VanderWerf)

Status: Closed

Priority: Normal

Assignee: matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)

Target version: 2.0.0

ruby -v: ruby 1.9.2dev (2010-05-31)

[x86_64-linux]

Backport:

Description

=begin

(Also, there is a warning that may be incorrect.)

\$ cat t.rb module M private

def attr_accessor(*args); super; end

end

class C extend M attr accessor:x end

C.new.x = 1

\$ ruby19 -v t.rb

ruby 1.9.2dev (2010-05-31) [x86_64-linux]

t.rb:3: warning: private attribute?

t.rb:11:in <main>': private method x=' called for #<C:0x000000012e5670> (NoMethodError)

=end

History

#1 - 06/08/2010 04:52 AM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

=begin Hi,

At Tue, 8 Jun 2010 01:18:50 +0900,

Joel VanderWerf wrote in [ruby-core:30638]:

Bug #3406: attr_accessor creates a private writer method

\$ ruby19 -v t.rb

ruby 1.9.2dev (2010-05-31) [x86 64-linux]

t.rb:3: warning: private attribute?

t.rb:11:in <main>': private method x=' called for #<C:0x000000012e5670> (NoMethodError)

The cause is that executing cref is used, whereas class definition cref should be used.

Doesn't seem to need the separate module.

Just a test case for the present.

diff --qit a/test/ruby/test module.rb b/test/ruby/test module.rb

index c2084a2..8963b37 100644

--- a/test/ruby/test_module.rb

+++ b/test/ruby/test_module.rb

@@ -921,4 +921,17 @@ class TestModule < Test::Unit::TestCase

end

end

• def test_attr_inherited_visibility

11/14/2025 1/2

- c = Class.new do
- •
- •
- •
- •
- •
- end.new
- bug3406 = '[ruby-core:30638]'
- assert_nothing_raised(bug3406) {c.x = 1}
- assert_equal(1, c.x, bug3406)
- end

Nobu Nakada

=end

#2 - 06/28/2010 03:59 AM - mame (Yusuke Endoh)

- Target version changed from 1.9.2 to 2.0.0

=begin

Hi,

I really doubt whether or not this is a bug. Very clumsy semantics is required to "fix" this. At least, any change for this issue should not be included in 1.9.2.

What we really need is a general way for users to define attr_accessor-like method, I guess. IOW, we need a way to get a visibility of current caller context and to define a method with the visibility.

--

Yusuke Endoh mame@tsg.ne.jp =end

#3 - 10/19/2010 02:56 PM - mrkn (Kenta Murata)

- Assignee set to matz (Yukihiro Matsumoto)

=begin

=end

#4 - 10/24/2010 02:17 PM - nobu (Nobuyoshi Nakada)

- Status changed from Open to Closed
- % Done changed from 0 to 100

=begin

This issue was solved with changeset r29578. Joel, thank you for reporting this issue. Your contribution to Ruby is greatly appreciated. May Ruby be with you.

=end

11/14/2025 2/2